



METROPOLITAN
TRANSPORTATION
COMMISSION

Joseph P. Bort MetroCenter
101 Eighth Street
Oakland, CA 94607-4700
TEL 510.817.5700
TTY/TDD 510.817.5769
FAX 510.817.5848
E-MAIL info@mtc.ca.gov
WEB www.mtc.ca.gov

Scott Haggerty, Chair
Alameda County

MTC PLANNING COMMITTEE
JANUARY 14, 2011
MINUTES

Adrienne J. Tissier, Vice Chair
San Mateo County

Tom Azumbrado
U.S. Department of Housing
and Urban Development

Tom Bates
Cities of Alameda County

Dean J. Chu
Cities of Santa Clara County

Dave Cortese
Association of Bay Area Governments

Chris Daly
City and County of San Francisco

Bill Dodd
Napa County and Cities

Dorene M. Giacomini
U.S. Department of Transportation

Federal D. Glover
Contra Costa County

Anne W. Halsted
San Francisco Bay Conservation
and Development Commission

Steve Kinsey
Marin County and Cities

Sue Lempert
Cities of San Mateo County

Jake Mackenzie
Sonoma County and Cities

Jon Rubin
San Francisco Mayor's Appointee

Bijan Sartipi
State Business, Transportation
and Housing Agency

James P. Spering
Solano County and Cities

Amy Rein Worth
Cities of Contra Costa County

Ken Yeager
Santa Clara County

Steve Heminger
Executive Director

Ann Flemer
Deputy Executive Director, Policy

Andrew B. Fremier
Deputy Executive Director, Operations

ATTENDANCE

Commissioner Spering called the MTC Planning Committee meeting to order at 10:010 a.m. Planning Committee members in attendance were: Azumbrado, Chu, Giacomini, Halsted, Lempert, Mackenzie, Rein-Worth, Rubin, and Yeager. Commissioners Bates, Cortese, Dodd, Haggerty, Sartipi, and Tissier were also in attendance.

CONSENT CALENDAR: Minutes of December 10, 2010

Commissioner Worth moved approval of the Consent Calendar, Commissioner Mackenzie seconded. Motion passed unanimously.

MTC PLANNING COMMITTEE/ABAG ADMINISTRATIVE
COMMITTEE/JOINT POLICY COMMITTEE DISCUSSION: 2013

RTP/SCS Development:

Attendees present were:

- Susan Adams, Supervisor, County of Marin
- Geoffrey Gibbs
- Rose Jacobs Gibson, Supervisor, County of San Mateo
- John Gioia, Supervisor, County of Contra Costa
- Mark Green, Mayor, City of Union City
- Steve Kinsey, Supervisor, Marin County
- Sam Liccardo, Councilmember, City of San Jose
- Julie Pierce, Councilmember, City of Clayton
- Pamela Torliatt, Mayor, City of Petaluma

3. 2013 RTP/SCS Development

a) Performance Targets, MTC Resolution No. 3987

Ms. Lisa Klein, MTC and Mr. Paul Fassinger, ABAG presented a revised recommendation for the SCS/RTP performance targets. Ms. Klein stated that the ABAG Executive Committee will consider the targets for approval on January 20, 2011, and is asking the MTC Planning Committee to forward the targets for approval by the full Commission on January 26, 2011.

Ms. Klein stated that the performance targets are expressions in measurable terms of the outcomes that staff wants to achieve for the SCS and RTP; however, they are just for scenario assessment – they are not standards or restrictions on local government decision making.

She stated that the targets will provide a framework to assess and inform the policy decisions on transportation investments, and MTC and ABAG staff intend to measure progress toward the targets periodically.

Ms. Klein submitted a memo from MTC's Policy Advisory Council who endorsed the recommended targets, but did note that the targets do not directly articulate two goals of particular interest to the Council, which are: 1) locating jobs and housing near transit, and 2) increasing the share of trips by non-auto modes. The Council stated that if these concepts are not included in the targets explicitly, they would like to see a robust analysis of these issues in the scenario process. She stated that staff does plan to conduct this kind of analysis to explain how and why the scenarios work.

Ms. Klein summarized the 10 targets in the agenda packet, and how they addressed committee comments provided to staff at the December 2010 joint committee meeting. In closing, Ms. Klein stated that during the months of February through September 2011, staff will assess the scenarios and generate several analysis, including the Performance Targets, Equity Analysis, data summaries and additional analysis and indicator data. She recommended that the Planning Committee refer MTC Resolution No. 3987 to the Commission for adoption later this month.

Commissioner Rubin asked how cutting of funds to the redevelopment agencies will affect the overall redevelopment. Ms. Klein stated that, in terms of the planning process, staff will be monitoring the progress and have opportunity throughout the SCS development to talk about the policy implementation.

Commissioner Spring called for public comment:

- David Schonbrunn, TRANSDEF, summarized the Policy Advisory Council's concerns, and stated that there were two distinct visions presented at the Policy Advisory Council meeting: 1) a status quo vision, and 2) a transit-focused vision, yet staff only presented one option to the Planning Committee.
- Diana Rohini Lavigne, Bay Area Bicycle Coalition, promoted the healthy lifestyle to create a more environmental-friendly transportation system.
- Stephanie Reyes, Greenbelt Alliance, expressed her support on Target #2, and Target #6.
- Tilly Chang, SFCTA, expressed her general support of the performance measures, and highlighted three points on how she thinks they could be further improved by: 1) disaggregating transit travel times vs. auto travel times, 2) looking at jobs near high quality transit, and 3) including a cost effectiveness.
- Linda Best, Contra Costa Council, expressed support for the Economic Vitality Target.
- John Coleman, Bay Planning Coalition, urged the committee to keep in mind the economy and jobs that need to be produced and kept in the Bay Area.
- Henry Hilken, Bay Area Air Quality Management District, expressed his support on staff's recommendation on the performance targets and urged the committee to direct staff to consider reducing diesel emissions and exposures either through the indicators that staff will be working on or through the equity analysis.

- Azibutke Akaba, Regional Asthma Management and Prevention, would like to see more detail in the methodology such as how the 10% is going to show up in the transit-oriented development areas and the PDAs.
- Colin Miller, Urban Habitat, stated that the snapshot analysis as part of the equity analysis that will consider conditions on the ground in real time should be elevated to the same importance of the targets in evaluating the scenarios. He expressed concern that: Target #1 does not encourage total greenhouse gas emissions; and that Targets #9 and #10 should address transit funding.
- Jeff Hobson, TransForm, expressed his support with the inclusion of displacement in Target #2, particulate matter in Target #3, and the re-writing of open space in Target #6. He mentioned that Target #10 can be improved by focusing the target on good repair in the areas that local government and the region sees as the priority for focused growth.
- Parisa Fatehi, Public Advocates, urged the committee to support the development of other complimentary measures to the targets.
- Sandi Galvez, Bay Area Regional Health and Equities Initiative, stated that jobs and housing balance needs to be explicitly addressed as a target. She noted that there needs to be an explicit target of increasing ridership on the transit system and other modes of transportation other than the automobile.

After a lengthy discussion among the committee members, Chair Sperling requested staff to summarize the comments heard for each target, and then called for a motion on each target.

Target #1: Ms. Klein stated that she heard two principle comments: 1) the target should aim to reduce total emissions, and 2) the target should look beyond the cars and light-duty truck sources. The committee approved Target #1 as proposed.

Target #2: Ms. Klein stated that she heard Mayor Green indicate the support for including a definition of displacement. Mr. Steve Heminger stated the definition is included in the target. Mr. Gibbs moved approval. Commissioner Lempert seconded. The committee approved Target #2 with the inclusion of the displacement definition.

Target #3: Ms. Klein stated that she heard a request to add language articulating the intent to achieve greater emission reductions in highly impacted areas and include asthma health impacts as an indicator. The committee approved Target #3 with added language for the target to achieve greater reductions in highly impacted areas and with the diesel particulates and asthma listed as indicators.

Target #4: Mr. Heminger stated that he heard committee members express interest in a target to reduce collisions per mile or per capita. The committee approved Target #4 as proposed.

Target #5: Ms. Klein stated that she heard that 15 minutes per person is still not ambitious enough. Commissioner Mackenzie moved approval. Target #5 was approved as proposed.

Target #6: Mr. Fassinger stated that he heard the suggestion of removing the word “current”. The committee approved Target #6 with the elimination of the word “current”.

Target #7: The committee approved Target #7 as proposed.

Target #8: The committee approved Target #8 as proposed.

Target #9: Ms. Fassinger stated that he heard incorporating other modes as opposed to the overall goal of reducing trip time. It was suggested that the target read,. The committee approved Target #9 with: “decrease average per trip non-auto travel time by 10% and decrease the per capita auto vehicle miles traveled by 10%”.

Target #10: The committee approved Target #10 as proposed.

Supervisor Adams motioned approval to forward the performance targets, with the noted changes, to MTC and ABAG Executive Board for approval. Commissioner Mackenzie seconded. Motion passed unanimously.

b) NGO-based Alternative Proposal

Ms. Ashley Nguyen stated that TRANSDEF made a request for MTC and ABAG to allow non-profits and non-governmental organizations to prepare an alternative for the RTP/SCS. Staff has reviewed this request and is recommending that the committees move forward with an NGO-based alternative developed with clear parameters and delivery milestones as stipulated in Attachment A to the staff memo.

Commissioner Spring called for public comment:

- David Schonbrunn, TRANSDEF, expressed support for an NGO or a public interest alternative.
- Robert Sokai, East Bay Economic Development Alliance, hopes the analyses respect the necessity to maintain a viable economy and jobs.
- Linda Best questioned whether there is a need to develop a NGO-based alternative scenario. She believes that the process set by MTC and ABAG is extremely inclusive, transparent, and open and thinks it's an opportunity for all stakeholders to take part in that process.
- Carl Anthony, Breaththrough Communities, expressed his concern with the cost to NGOs for putting together a viable alternative; therefore, in order for this process to work, MTC must make available the resources that are necessary to have a first rate alternative developed and defined.
- Diana Rohini Lavigne, Bay Area Bicycle Coalition, believes the process that is currently proposed requires some additional clarifications before the NGO community can strategize on effective methods and a process.
- Colin Miller, Urban Habitat, expressed his concern with how the NGO's would participate in collaborating with MTC and ABAG staff.
- Stephanie Reyes, Greenbelt Alliance, expressed her concern that a separate NGO-based alternative could be counter productive.
- Jeff Hobson, TransForm, echoed several of the concerns expressed by the previous speakers.

After committee discussion, the majority of the MTC Planning Committee did not support the staff recommendation, agreeing with members of the NGO community that it would be better to include their input into the development of alternatives by MTC and ABAG, rather than a parallel effort. No further action was taken on the staff recommendation.

c) Initial Vision Scenario Development

Mr. Ken Kirkey, ABAG, stated that they received extensive input from the local jurisdictions on proposed housing growth assumptions. The Initial Vision Scenario is scheduled to be released on March 11, 2011, which will include a test against the performance targets.

He also mentioned that public participation workshops are being scheduled in each of the counties to discuss the Initial Vision Scenario, and that MTC and ABAG have received a grant from the Strategic Growth Council to conduct specific outreach to community-based organizations and communities of concern.

OTHER BUSINESS/PUBLIC COMMENT

There being no other business, the meeting adjourned at 12:50 p.m. The Committee's next meeting is scheduled for Wednesday, February 9, 2011 at 10:15 a.m. in the Lawrence D. Dahms Auditorium, Joseph P. Bort MetroCenter, Oakland, CA.